Music Theory Society of New York State

Annual Meeting

Hunter College, CUNY
18-19 April 1998

PRELIMINARY PROGRAM

Saturday, 18 April

9:00 - 10:00 -- Registration (Hunter College North, 4th Floor)

10:00 - 12:00 -- ANALYSIS AND PERFORMANCE

10:00 - 12:00 -- STORIES AND MUSIC

12:00 - 1:00 -- Lunch

1:00 - 1:45 -- Lecture- Recital: "A Textural Problem in Beethoven's Op. 90" - Susan Kagan (President of the American Beethoven Society, New York Chapter)

1:45 - 4:00 -- BEETHOVEN

1:45 - 4:00 -- TWENTIETH-CENTURY THEORETICAL MODELS

4:00 - 4:30 -- Coffee Break

4:30 - 5:30 -- Keynote Address - "Looking at the Urline." Hedi Siegel (Hunter College, CUNY)

5:30 - 6:30 -- Reception

Sunday, 19 April

8:00 - 9:30 -- Board Meeting

9:30 - 12:30 -- BACH

9:30 - 12:30 -- TWENTIETH-CENTURY DIATONICISM

12:30 - 1:15 -- Lunch

1:15 - 2:00 -- Business Meeting

2:00 - 4:15 -- THEORIES IN ACTION

2:00 - 4:15 -- META-THEORY
Analysis and Performance

Jewell Thompson (Hunter College), Chair

- The Analysis of Performance: Pedagogical and Methodological Implications, James Mathes (Florida State University)
- Performance and its Implications for Analysis, Cynthia Folio (Temple University)
The Analysis of Performance: Pedagogical and Methodological Implications

James Mathes
Florida State University

A recurrent problem in clarifying the relationship between analysis and performance is the difficulty in establishing a correspondence between an analytic observation and a performance decision. The problem is related to the prevalent tendency to treat analysis as an independent activity that may inform performance decisions, a tendency that circumvents the interaction of analysis and performance. This paper examines this problem and explores the value of evaluating and comparing recorded performances as a means of clarifying the relation between analysis and performance. Select musical excerpts from works by Bach, Beethoven, and Chopin are examined, drawing on recordings, the literature on analysis and performance, and comments by performers. The discussion of the various works focuses on how the interaction of analysis and performance may be amplified by considering how different performance decisions project different analyses of the music.

Though criteria for performance decisions cannot be unequivocally determined from recorded performances, the process of evaluating a performance stimulates analytic discussion through direct connection with the music as sound. The analysis of performances is a strong pedagogical tool that encourages critical listening, develops skill in making analytic choices from viable alternatives, and promotes analysis as a tool for problem solving rather than an independent activity. It also emphasizes the importance to performers of the style, genre, and surface details of the music, aspects that are often undervalued in many analytic methodologies.
Performance and its Implications for Analysis

Cynthia Folio
Temple University

One problem in the area of analysis and performance is that the questions that theorists ask are not always questions that will be relevant to performers. I intend to present an approach to the topic that is more performance-centered, so that performers' thoughts and interpretations form a starting point for ideas concerning analysis. One benefit is that the kind of inspiration that good performances can motivate the analyst to find interesting insights that might not have otherwise been uncovered. Another benefit is that when the topic is approached in this way, the performer can become "hooked" on theory, and analysis becomes an exciting activity.

After outlining several ideas about how performance can provide the impetus for analysis, I will illustrate this relationship through an analysis of various interpretations of Chopin's Prelude No.3 in G major. While this composition is simple on the surface, it presents some conflicts that can be understood better through a combination of analysis and listening to what performers do. Experienced performers are experts on how to inspire an audience and they can tell us much about the music that they have literally lived with for years. If we as theorists are willing to listen and to react in a way that is sensitive to their insights and their issues, performers will find that they also have much to learn through analysis.

Session | Program
Saturday, 10:00 - noon
Lang Recital Hall

Stories and Music

Christopher Park (The Mannes College of Music), Chair

- **Weak Openings and Open Endings: On Schumann's Romantic Song Forms**, David Ferris (University of Houston)
- **Toward a Semiotic Model of Film Music**, Scott Murphy (Eastman School of Music)
- **Composition and Collage: Morton Subornick's The Key to the Songs**, Leigh Vanhandel (Stanford University/University of New Mexico)

Program
WEAK OPENINGS AND OPEN ENDINGS: SCHUMANN'S ROMANTIC SONG FORMS

David Ferris
University of Houston

The weak opening, which is one of the primary techniques that Schumann uses to create fragmentary song forms, can be defined as a piece whose tonal definition is purposefully weakened at its beginning and gradually becomes clarified as it continues. While in some cases a song may have no initial tonic harmony at all, in others Schumann begins with a tonic chord but destabilizes it through voiceleading, phrase rhythm, harmonic structure, register, or some combination of these elements. It is this latter technique that I will consider here, both as an experiment in form and as a musical response to the Romantic lyric poems that Schumann set in his early song cycles. I will illustrate my discussion with analyses of "Frühlingsnacht" and "Intermezzo, both from the Eichendorff Liederkreis.

Weak openings are examples of end-accented structures, by which I mean that the rhythmic impulse with which a given phrase or section ends is stronger than the impulse with which it begins. Because such structures tend to replicate hierarchically, a weak opening arouses the expectation of an especially strong conclusion. Schumann fulfills this expectation in "Frühlingsnacht" and we perceive this song as a closed musical form. But in the case of "Intermezzo" he exploits the expectations that the weak opening arouses by repeatedly preparing and then thwarting a strong tonic arrival, and he thus creates a form that has harmonic closure yet still feels openended.
Toward a Semiotic Model of Film Music

Scott Murphy
Eastman School of Music

The primary challenge for an analysis of film music is the dichotomous nature of the genre itself; it requires a substantial theoretical understanding of two sensory orders—film and music—and their interaction. As a result of this weighty demand, most film music analyses have tacitly resorted to four antiquated and unrefined prototypical tools: parallelism/counterpoint, diegetic/non-diegetic, denotation/connotation and leitmotivic/non-leitmotivic. Each of these tools is inefficiently blunt; only the coarsest deductions can be made about the work. The goal of this model of film music is to consolidate these four tools within a broader theoretical construct, thus allowing for gradations within and between each of the four systems.

In the search for a model and its mode of application, certain theories and analytical tools that fall under the rubric of semiotics provide starting points. Christian Metz's hypothesis that simultaneous sensory orders may be considered syntagmatically allows the model to utilize semiotic theories originally designed to look at linear relations, such as those in language. Since the model is specifically concerned with meanings of the two sensory orders, Julien Greimas's theory of structural semantics offers a possible prototype. Greimas's theory of grammatical intelligibility asserts that two adjacent signs form a comprehensive syntagm if they share a common property or meaning. The proposed model of film music expands upon Greimas's initial ideas, permitting both the visual and aural signs to express several meanings on different symbolic levels. Thus, the many ways in which visual meanings and aural meanings may be related to one another redefines and expands upon the four proto-theoretical tools. Representative analyses of excerpts of film music by Max Steiner, Erich Wolfgang Korngold, Bernard Herrmann, and John Corigliano reinforce the modeling technique.

Session | Program
Composition and Collage: Morton Subotnick's *The Key to Songs*

Leigh Vanhandel
Stanford University/University of New Mexico

Collage has served as a powerful compositional technique throughout the twentieth century, boasting such notable practitioners as Stravinsky, Stockhausen, and, more recently, Morton Subotnick. Subotnick's *The Key to Songs* (1985) is the first in a trilogy of works each modeled on a separate collage "novel" by the Surrealist artist Max Ernst. In each piece of his trilogy, Subotnick attempts to represent musically the bizarre worlds of Ernst's innovative novels. In *The Key to Songs*, his means include imitation of and musical corollaries to Ernst's visual collages, whose influences range from Freudian psychology to literary theory and games.

It is easy to discuss the influence of collage on musical composition; what is more difficult is to provide an analysis demonstrating specific parallels between the two artforms. In the music world, as well as in the art world, the term 'collage' has been a very fluid one. This paper defines two styles of collage, the analytical and the synthetic; explores Subotnick's compositional technique in terms of source material, form, and motives; and discusses the relationships between Ernst's and Subotnick's methodologies. In addition, the paper discusses various linguistic influences on Ernst's art and their translation into Subotnick's musical language.
Beethoven

Garry Brodhead (Ithaca College), Chair

- Temporal Disjunction and Centrifugal Organicism: Rhythmic Disruption as a Form of Coherence. Frank Samarotto (College-Conservatory of Music, Cincinnati)
Alternative Meanings in the First Movement of Beethoven's String Quartet in Eb Major, Op. 127: Emergence and Growth from Stagnation and Decline

Eric McKee
Pennsylvania State University

The first part of the paper attempts to interpret Beethoven's use of the term Maestoso in the first movement of Op. 127 by asking the questions: what did the term Maestoso mean in Beethoven's time, what does it mean in Beethoven's works, and what does it mean in Op. 127? From this discussion I show that Beethoven uses the term Maestoso to signal the musical topic of a French Overture. Beethoven's portrayal of the French overture is, however, undercut by various musical means to the point of failure. From out of the crippled Maestoso seamlessly emerges the Allegro section. In stark contrast, the Allegro suggests the topic of the pastoral, but one elevated in stature by the use of a contrapuntal texture and continuous motivic development and expansion. The juxtaposition of these topics creates an expressive plot: emergence and growth from stagnation and decline. Examination of the dynamic Opposition between these topics provides a conceptual framework from which to interpret the formal and expressive discourse of the entire movement.

The topic of the French overture typically signifies a high aristocratic style. The pastoral, on the other hand, signifies a lower style often associated with nature and/or people of the lower classes. The final part of the paper explores Beethoven's reversal of the structural status of these two topics and what that reversal might suggest in terms of extramusical interpretations of the movement (e.g., decline of the ancien régime and the rise and growth of a democratic and egalitarian middle class).
Temporal Disjunction and Centrifugal Organicism: Rhythmic Disruption as a Form of Coherence

Frank Samarotto  
College-Conservatory of Music, Cincinnati

Superficial disruptions to the temporal flow of music are rarely the central focus of the theorist. Most analytical approaches to tonal music have tended to emphasize coherence and continuity over conflict and discontinuity. This paper will reverse this concern by proceeding from a concept I have termed \textit{temporal disjunction}. This analytical tool generalizes the common sense meaning of disjunct rhythms (abrupt changes of durational value) to include any sudden parametric change or denial of expected continuation that creates a wrinkle in the temporal fabric. Rhythmic disjunctions are necessarily violations of the fifth species principle of equilibrium. Schenker ambivalently viewed disequilibrium in free composition as both an awkwardness to be avoided and as a possible source of motivic coherence.

This paper addresses first a passage in the third movement of Haydn's Piano Sonata No. 52 in Eb, where a temporal disjunction has origins in the disjunct rhythms of the opening measures, creating a kind of coherence out of the disruption. In addition, the disjunction simulates a change of tempo, suggesting interrelations of different movements.

A detailed analysis of the fifth movement of Beethoven's String Quartet Op. 131 reveals that both unity and disjunction are essential parts of its structure. A possible way of reconciling this contradiction would be to adopt a more complex model of organic coherence based on a tension between two opposite impulses: the centripetal, and the centrifugal. The domain of the temporal in general and disjunction in particular are seen as a crystallization of these two forces.
Beethoven's "New and Different Style": The First Movement of Op. 59 No. 1

L. Michael Griffel
Hunter College, CUNY

When Haydn composed his Op. 33 string quartets in 1781, he stated that these six works exhibited "an entirely new, very special manner"--a style that we today recognize as Viennese Classicism. Like Haydn, Beethoven moved the art of music into a new phase, one that we now call early Romanticism, when he composed a set of three string quartets in 1805-06, the Op. 59 "Rasumovsky" Quartets. This paper examines some of the features of the opening movement of the first of these quartets that help define the novel musical style introduced by Beethoven. These features include a dramatically heightened use of elision, the subtle manipulation of conventional phrasing, an effort to camouflage structural signposts in the sonata-allegro form, the inflation of the length and intensity of the development section, strange and unsettling sonorities, and strings of ambiguously multifunctional chromatic chords.

Session | Program
TWENTIETH-CENTURY THEORETICAL MODELS

Elizabeth Marvin West (Eastman School of Music), Chair

- A Theory of Time-Spaces for the Analysis of Twentieth-Century Music: Aspects of the First Movement of Bartók’s Fifth String Quartet. Daphne Leong (Eastman School of Music)
- Modeling Harmonic Vagueness: A Fuzzy-Set Approach to Quartal Harmony. Brian Robison (Cornell University)
- Dualism and Fugal Answers. Norman Carey (Eastman School of Music)
Innovations of rhythmic style are a hallmark of Béla Bartók's music. Characterized by the repetition and transformation of rhythmic patterns, by the articulation of regular and irregular metric structures, and by the successive and simultaneous juxtaposition of such patterns and meters, Bartók's music displays a rich variety and ingenuity of rhythmic practice. Previous work on rhythm in Bartók has focused on questions of proportion and ethnomusicology. This paper proposes a theoretical framework and analytical method relevant to the analysis of twentieth-century music, and illustrates the application of the theory in an analysis of the first movement of Bartók's Fifth String Quartet.

Drawing on the work of David Lewin, Robert Morris, and Elizabeth West Marvin, and incorporating Bartók's writings on rhythm, the study defines seven inter-related temporal spaces (termed u-time, modu-time, mtime, mod-time, vdur-space, dur-space, and d-space) and transformations on segments within each of these spaces. The spaces provide a formal way of viewing various rhythmic aspects of a set of articulations, while the transformations provide a way of observing the changes made between related sets of articulations.

Application of the theory to the first movement of Bartók's Fifth String Quartet reveals characteristic rhythmic segments and transformations, and their roles in delineating form. One such segment, consisting of three progressively shorter durations, teams with unison texture to mark cadential points. Another reifies certain ratios significant to the movement's rhythmic structure, and embodies the alliance of certain operators in expressing these ratios. The analysis also demonstrates a close connection between pitch/pitch-class and rhythmic structure in the movement.

The closing section of the paper explores implications of the theory and suggests applications to other repertoires, such as the music of Igor Stravinsky, Elliot Carter, and Conlon Nancarrow.
Modeling harmonic vagueness: A fuzzy-set approach to quartal harmony

Brian Robinson
Cornell University

The present study begins by surveying the intrinsic vagueness of many musical parameters, including timbre, texture, dynamics, and duration, for which our traditional notation allows only limited precision. The problem of intrinsic vagueness extends to parameter which we can notate with a higher degree of precision, such as pitch; the concept of quartal harmony provides an example of a familiar notion of intervallic structure that resists precise formulation. That is, although precise definitions of quartal harmony are possible, they prove overly restrictive in relation to actual musical practice. Analysis can proceed more fruitfully from evaluating any given pitch set as possessing some degree of quartal character (e.g. as extremely quartal, strongly quartal, loosely quartal, weakly quartal, or negligibly quartal, rather than as either (absolutely) quartal or (absolutely) not quartal.

Fuzzy-set theory provides a formal methodology for describing sets which are based on graded membership. An introduction of the basic concepts of fuzzy-set theory leads to the definition of three broad classes of sonorities. One of these is the set of quartal/quintal sonorities, labeled as the set Q; for the sake of comparison, the sets of secundal/septal sonorities (S) and tertial/sextal sonorities (T) are also defined. A simple algorithm uses the ordinal proximity of pitches in a sonority to weight the terms of its interval-class vector; these weighted terms can be used to assign the sonority grades of membership in the sets Q, S, and T. This procedure is then used to evaluate the quartal character of pitch sets in examples from the music of Bartók, Messiaen, and Ligeti.
Dualism and Fugal Answers

Norman Carey
Eastman School of Music

Regardless of its questionable acoustical foundations, the dualist perspective of the major/minor tonal system advanced by Oettingen and Riemann reflects an obvious truism, namely that the diatonic system is inversionally symmetric with respect to 2 of the major scale. Properties of inversive symmetry in a diatonic context are investigated within the methodology provided by David Lewin's Generalized Interval Systems. A system of six GIS structures serves as a model for common practice tonality. The model provides a platform from which to investigate the problem of tonal answers in the fugue. Various fugue treatises propose a number of apparently unrelated ad hoc procedures by which to initiate the young composer into the intricacies of the problem of fugal answers. The current study shows an underlying unity in these procedures, arising out of the dualist perspective as modeled by the GIS structures. This in turn leads to a method of constructing fugal subjects rich with inversive potential.

While the topic of fugal answers is inevitably complex, it is noteworthy that a combination of techniques new and old can, at least in broad strokes, capture many of the most important techniques, promising significant pedagogical application. Finally, the paper provides an entirely practical application for a much-maligned speculative theory.
Sunday, 9:30 - 12:30
Lang Recital Hall

BACH

Robert Gauldin (Eastman School of Music), Chair

Introduction by George Stauffer, President of the American Bach Society and Chair of the Music Department at Hunter College

- Metrical Contradictions in Bach's Suites for Solo Violoncello: Lecture Recital. Eleanor F. Trawick (Ball State University)
- 'Welt, Gute Nacht': Performance Issues in Evoking World Weariness and the 'Sleep of Death' in Bach's Arias for Bass: Lecture Recital. Chandler Carter (Hofstra University)
- J. S. Bach's Parallel-Section Constructions. Joel Lester (Mannes College of Music)

Program
Metrical Contradictions in Bach's Suites for Solo Violoncello

Eleanor Trawick  
Ball State University

Bach's Suites for Solo Violoncello invite analysis from a number of different points of view, and not simply for their rhythmic ingenuity. With so much depth and so many riches lying just below the immediate surface, it is tempting to look right past the most obvious and superficial of the characteristics of the suites- their genre, and the designation of the individual movements as "Allemand," "Courante," and the like. Yet the dances Bach inherited, with their metrical formulae and rhythmic conventions, still play a role in the cello suites, serving as foils to the more complex and unpredicatable ingredients. This tension, between an expected metric regularity and the metric irregularity of the actual pieces, is one of the most intriguing features of the suites.

This analysis will address some of the problems of rhythm and meter encountered in performing the cello suites, and it will discuss some of the ways that Bach systematically undermines regular meter and rhythmic patterns. For example, repeated motives often change their metrical placement within a movement, displacing the accents. Large-scale syncopations disrupt the meter when agogic and tonal accents contradict the notated meter for several measures at a time. And, in order to make sense of the counterpoint and voice-leading, the performer must often exaggerate the length or dynamics of particular notes; in many places such an accommodation to contrapuntal requirements contradicts the meter.
"Welt, gute Nacht" -- Performance Issues in Evoking World Weariness and the "Sleep of Death" in Bach's Arias for Bass: Lecture Recital

Chandler Carter  
Hofstra University

The Lutheran view of Christian death as a blessed relief from the tribulations of earthly life is a recurrent theme in J. S. Bach's church cantatas. Bach exploits a variety of rhetorical devices -- both literary and musical -- to dramatize the soul as world-weary, oppressed by the burden of earthly life or fearful of hell. Through the consoling grace of Christ, death comes as a welcomed relief- depicted as restful sleep, an easy ascent to heaven or an ecstatic arrival.

Bach was drawn to the bass voice as a particularly expressive vehicle for the personalized (as distinct from the collective choral) expression of these themes. Drawing from several different cantatas arias, I propose to demonstrate how Bach realizes two particular aspects of this "longing for death" theme -- 1) the eagerness to depart from the world; and 2) the "sleep of death" -- through characteristic harmonic structures and by exploiting qualities unique to the bass voice. In addition, I offer my own ideas on how the performer may underscore their interpretation through performance.

The recital portion of the presentation will include two arias featuring oboe obbligato, "Ich habe genug" from BWV 82 and the aria "Es ist vollbracht" from BWV 159.

Session | Program
J. S. Bach's Parallel-Section Constructions

Joel Lester
The Mannes College of Music

Did Johann Sebastian Bach's various types of compositions emanate from the same creative genius? Shockingly, the answer to this question might well be an emphatic "No!" if one views the incredibly wide range of analytic tools and procedures applied to his works in different genres.

This presentation proposes, by contrast, that there are three principles that provide a unified perspective on all of Bach's compositional creations: first, that the opening of a piece states a core of material that is worked with throughout the composition; second, that recurrences of material almost invariably exhibit a heightening level of activity in some or all musical elements; and third, that Bach quite frequently organizes his movements in roughly parallel sections in which these heightened recurrences occur.

A survey of well-known movements in each of Bach's major genres provides an overview of how these principles lead to a unified perspective on Bach's creative genius in all the genres in which he composed, and relates the resulting perspective to structural ideas of Bach's era that are fundamentally different from those of later eras.
Sunday, 9:30 - 12:30
Brecher Hall

TWEN TIETH-CEN TURY DIATONIC ISM

Wayne Alpern (CUNY Graduate Center), Chair

- Tonal and Motivic Structures of Prokofiev's 'Wrong Notes,' Deborah Rifken (Eastman School of Music)
- Choral Tone Centers in Stravinsky's Neoclassical Music, Matthew Santa (CUNY Graduate Center)
- Pentatonic Structures in Louise Talma's First-Period Compositions, Luann Dragone (CUNY Graduate Center)

Program
Tonal and Motivic Structures of Prokofiev's 'Wrong Notes'

Deborah Rifken
Eastman School of Music

The aim of this paper is to show how Prokofiev's "wrong note passages" participate in tonal structures and motivic parallelisms. "Wrong notes" is a term used by many scholars to describe the chromatic surprises of Prokofiev's music. His middleground structures create conventional tonal expectations because of their traditional cadential goals and phrase structures, making the wrong-note chromatic modulations to distant keys within phrases seem as if they are modernist spices added to an otherwise tonal structure. However, these wrong notes are a consistent part of Prokofiev's early Russian and late Soviet style and as such the label "wrong" hardly seems appropriate. The chromatic excursions that wrong notes incite are not wrong at all, but rather they are an essential aspect of Prokofiev's music.

Wrong-note passages create a weak structural coherence because their foreground progressions are not direct diminutions of middleground ones. Their structures rely on foreground progressions that do not have harmonic function but rather have only voice-leading significance. The paper discusses how such weak hierarchical relationships are part of Schenker's analyses as well as part of the analytic tradition continued by contemporary Schenkerians. I will show that strong motivic connections created by the chromatic voice-leading that the wrong-note passages inspire, mitigate the weakened structural coherence of wrong note progressions. In light of these structural motivic connections, the term "wrong note" is particularly ironic.
Chordal Tone Centers in Stravinsky's Neoclassical Music

Matthew Santa
CUNY Graduate Center

Much interesting work on the organization of pitch in Stravinsky's neoclassical music has dealt with identifying referential pitch collections and their tone centers. Despite the considerable contribution this work has made to an understanding of Stravinsky's neoclassical music, it has at times seemed ad hoc because no generalized theory of centricity has yet been written that might substantiate its claims. This paper seeks to identify factors by which we distinguish between the tone centers and the subordinate pitches of post-tonal diatonic harmonies found in Stravinsky's music, as well as to explore its tonal allusions and how they relate to the voice leading associated with them. It proposes that four types of factors be considered: 1) the intervallic composition of a harmony; 2) the doubling of a harmony; 3) the voicing of a harmony; and 4) the linear context in which a harmony appears. It then organizes these factors into a hierarchical scheme thereby allowing theorists to discuss in a roughly quantitative way the polarities in a given work and how they are balanced therein, as well as the relative strengths of cadences in a given work.
Pentatonic Structures in Louise Talma's First-Period Compositions

Luann Dragone
CUNY Graduate Center

The compositions of Louise Talma's first-period (1939-1953) have previously been analyzed in some minor studies that focused primarily on the works' harmonic aspects and relied on traditional harmonic theory to do so. But a careful examination of these compositions reveals a consistent compositional logic that exists independent of harmonic functionality. Although Talma's first-period "neo-classical" compositions often include triadic and/or extended triadic harmony, and at times display tonal centricity or implicit tonality, functional harmony is not a significant structural determinant of her music.

In this paper I demonstrate that pitch-class set structures based on the pentatonic scale dominate the first-period compositions and establish Talma's consistent harmonic vocabulary. Utilizing atonal set theory, I discuss the pitch-class set types that characterize the majority of Talma's first-period works. Talma's principal set, pentachord 5-35 <02479>, and its subsets comprise the basic harmonic vocabulary of the first period. I consider the transformational aspects of these sets, and the sharp focus of Talma's harmonic language that results in not only a saturation of the pentatonic pitch-class sets, but also pcsets with a similarity of pitch classes. Such understanding fosters a greater appreciation of Talma's compositional design, content, and intention.

Included in this paper are examples derived from Talma's Four-Handed Fun (1939), One Need Not Be a Chamber to Be Haunted (1941), Piano Sonata (1943), The Swing (1944), Alleluia in the Form of Toccata (1945), La Corona (1950-54), and Let's Touch The Sky (1952).

Session | Program
THEORIES IN ACTION

Deborah Kessler (Hunter College and NYU), Chair

- The Road Less Travelled: Howard Hanson's Set Theory. Allen Cohen (Hunter College, CUNY)
- Machaut to Mozart: An Expanded Theory of Renaissance Chord Connections. Laurdella Foulkes-Levy (University of Mississippi)
- Passing Dominant in Sonata Form: An Alternative to Schenkerian Sonata Form Analysis. Evgenij Kosiakin (Eastman School of Music)

Program
THE ROAD LESS TRAVELLED: HOWARD HANSON'S SET THEORY

Allen Cohen
Hunter College of CUNY

Although Howard Hanson (1896-1981) is generally known as a composer, conductor, administrator, and teacher, he also made a small but significant contribution to music theory in a 1960 book entitled *Harmonic Materials of Modern Music: Resources of the Tempered Scale*. This book proposed a system of classification for every possible collection of pitch-classes in the chromatic scale, showed ways of deriving larger collections from smaller ones, and demonstrated significant relationships among them. Hanson's theory anticipated, in significant ways, musical set theory as expounded in the works of Allen Forte and other writers.

Few except Hanson's students, and their students, have ever read his book, or know virtually anything of his theory or its somewhat arcane terminology. Thus most theorists, without bothering to read *Harmonic Materials* or even knowing the nature of its subject, have assumed that it is simply a blind alley not worth examining. Nevertheless, Hanson's theory is of interest, not merely as a curious footnote to the history of music theory, but as a potentially fruitful source for further investigation, and as a fascinating and impressive achievement on its own merits--an achievement for which Hanson has rarely received credit.

A comparison between contemporary set-class theory and Hanson's theory shows that while Hanson's theory was first, set theory is generally clearer, more consistent, and easier to interpret in a number of ways. Nevertheless, Hanson's theory can be shown to offer analytical insights into the relations between sonorities that set theory does not.
Machaut to Mozart: An Expanded Theory of Renaissance Chord Connections

Laurdella Foulkes-Levy
The University of Mississippi

In his book on *Modal Harmony* (1961), Hungarian musicologist and theorist Lajos Bárdos presented his theory that Renaissance harmonies could be understood as connections of chords that, while not functional, have certain relationships which can be documented. His theory is that the intervals connecting roots of chords in pre-tonal music differs in a distinct fashion from those of tonal music. Using a binary system of harmonic analysis, Bardos labeled root connections as either authentic or plagal, depending upon the interval and direction of the root motion. Authentic motion or steps are those we associate with an authentic cadence: ascending seconds, ascending fourths/descending fifths, as well as descending thirds, exemplified by the progression I-VI-II-V-I. Plagal motion or steps are the opposite. As IV-I (descending fourths/ascending fifths) represents a plagal cadence, those fourths/fifths as well as descending seconds and ascending thirds are considered plagal steps. Thus, all intervals connecting roots of chords are categorized as either authentic or plagal.

This paper explains Bárdos's theory of Renaissance chord connections in detail and expands upon it, using musical examples from two centuries before to two centuries after the late Renaissance. The results show a definite, though rarely steady, change from an emphasis on plagal to an emphasis on authentic motion. This is further documented as certain intervallic chord connections, namely fourths and fifths, become more prominent while others, such as the plagal seconds, become less so. Suggestions are made as to the practical use of this information, both for analytical and pedagogical purposes.
PASSING DOMINANT IN SONATA FORM: AN ALTERNATIVE TO SCHENKERIAN SONATA FORM ANALYSIS

Evgenij Kosiakin
Eastman School of Music

Heinrich Schenker's notorious example 100,5 in *Free Composition* (Beethoven's Sonata op. 2 no. 2, 1st movement) contradicts the entire practice of sonata form analysis set by Schenker himself by showing the key of the second theme in the exposition as a large scale dominant-divider rather than structural dominant. Though usually viewed as an odd exception from the well-established rule, this example may hint on the possibility of an alternative paradigm of sonata form analysis which was never developed by Schenker or his successors. In the proposed paper I will outline such a paradigm, seeking justification for it in standard multi-part voice-leading patterns; analyses of sonata-form movements by Beethoven and Schubert will be presented with the purpose of strengthening this argument by providing motivic reasons for their new readings. Finally, implications of the new approach will be considered with respect to the overall theory of form, especially in light of the recent attempts at the reconciliation between traditional and Schenkerian notions of form.
META-THEORY

Joseph Dubiel (Columbia University), Chair

- Formal Simplicity in MusicTheoretic Contexts, Nora A. Engebretsen (SUNY, Buffalo)
- Anti-Organicism in the Prologue of Debussy's Cello Sonata, Marianne Wheeldon (Florida State University)
- Why Organicism? A Brief Investigation into the History and Survival of an Idea, Marva Duerksen (CUNY Graduate Center)

Program
Formal Simplicity in Music-Theoretic Contexts

Nora A. Engebretsen
SUNY, Buffalo

Simplicity is commonly assumed to be a desirable characteristic of music-theoretical systems, yet few theorists have attempted to explain why this should be so, let alone to explore the nature of simplicity as related to theory and analysis in general. Numerous fundamental questions need to be answered, including, first and foremost, the questions of how simplicity is to be defined and, accordingly, how it is to be measured. As will be seen, the formulation of a precise definition or explication of simplicity is highly problematic; however, a body of literature exists in which logicians have grappled with the notion of theoretical simplicity in the context of the natural sciences, and this work will be of assistance in our investigation. Once we have a clearer account of what precisely is meant by "simplicity," we will begin to examine, through reference to various writings in music theory, the role simplicity can or should play in the construction and evaluation of music-theoretical systems. Questions to be addressed include: Is simplicity a formal or logical desideratum, or strictly an extra systemic aesthetic or pragmatic consideration? What is the status of simplicity as a criterion for choosing between competing theories and analyses? Do we value simplicity as just such a test of completed theories, or rather for the ways in which it informs the process of theory building? And with regard to analytically oriented theories in particular, does the notion of simplicity intersect with that of explanatory adequacy, and if so, how? Directions for future research will also be suggested.
Anti-organicism in the Prologue of Debussy's Cello Sonata.

Marianne Wheeldon
Florida State University

In 1915, Debussy began work on a series of Six Sonates pour divers instruments, of which three were completed: the Sonata for cello and piano (1915); the Sonata for flute, viola, and harp (1916), and the Sonata for violin and piano (1917). Debussy's decision to use sonata form in these works is surprising as it seems to represent a reversal of his musical aesthetic of the preceding years. Until the sonatas, both his compositions and the views expressed in his critical writings showed a preference for elasticity of form, that is, a freedom from traditional forms.

Of the nine movements, the Prologue of the Cello Sonata stands out for its close adherence to the harmonic and thematic format of sonata form, with eight distinct sections that clearly imitate the functions of introduction, first theme, second theme, development, climax, retransition, recapitulation, and codetta. Yet even with these overwhelming correspondences, the Prologue emphasizes an aesthetic distance from sonata form. The most significant way Debussy establishes this aesthetic difference is by inverting the organic principle of nineteenth-century sonata form. By imitating (and thus invoking) sonata form but then rejecting the organic principles it came to embody, Debussy acknowledges sonata form conventions while simultaneously inverting them. This paper explores anti-organicism in the Prologue of Debussy's Cello Sonata, and identifies the compositional approaches that create anti-organicism amid the many sonata and sonata-fortn references.
Why Organicism? A Brief Investigation into the History and Survival of an Idea

Marva Duerksen
CUNY Graduate Center

This paper responds to Kerman’s well-known critique of organicist models in music analysis. Kerman’s argument concerning organicism is that its force is primarily ideological, and that music analysts using the idea are simply validating the work selected. He argues further that twentieth century analysts—Schenker, Tovey, and Reti—used organicist models to protect nineteenth century music from the advent of modernism. Kerman views their efforts as an anachronistic imposition.

It is my belief that Kerman’s focus on ideological issues has obscured crucial philosophical and historical aspects of the idea—aspects which I address in the paper. First, what value did organicism have historically and philosophically? In other words, what did music analysts gain from their appropriation of organic models? Second, how did early analysts use the organic metaphor? what kind of explanatory power did it have for the music they discussed? Two case studies focus the discussion: first, a Beethoven string quartet analysis by Johann Christian Lobe (1850); and second, a Mozart string quartet analysis by Alexander Ulibishev (1843). Finally, I point out the illusory nature of the attack on organicism. I demonstrate first that one of organicism’s most provocative tenets—the belief that music has a will or spirit—has slackened very little in its appeal for present-day writers, Kerman included. And then I point out the historically accurate position of writers such as Schenker and Reti in applying organic concepts to music produced in the heyday of the idea. Organicism was not anachronistic but contemporary to the composition of nineteenth-century music.